

Interactive comment on “Earthquake preparedness among religious minority groups: The case of the Jewish ultra-orthodox society in Israel” by Tehila Erlich et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 11 February 2020

GENERAL COMMENT

The paper examines the effects of religious beliefs and customs on earthquake preparedness among the Jewish ultra-orthodox community in Israel. This is a very interesting and original subject within the topic of the difficult seismic preparedness of the general public.

However, I think that the paper needs to be reworked; for these reasons, I suggest a new submission after major revisions and hope that these few lines below can help.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



Abstract : the abstract outlines the findings of the survey and interviews, but the last sentence does not outline any new idea.

1. Introduction Please rewrite with more specific and more precise data and observations.

2.1 Earthquake preparedness: due to the title of the paper, this part should be rewritten to focus only on religious communities of the world or of the region, and not on 'marginalized minority groups'.

2.2 The Jewish Ultra-Orthodox Sector: does the word "sector" mean that the JUO community live in a specific area? As it is not well known in Europe for instance, please also precise if the JUO have a specific language, etc.

2.3 Earthquake Hazard in Jerusalem Please add a figure showing Israel, Jerusalem, and fault lines with dots or stars illustrating historic and instrumental earthquakes with intensities or magnitudes. Make a zoom on the eventual JUO sector of Jerusalem and eventual seismic zoning (if it does exist) and eventual shaking maps (if they do exist): the aim of this demand is to illustrate the specific vulnerability of the people and buildings.

3.1 Survey How many questionnaires were sent OR give a percentage of responses (can help distinguishing persons interested in preparedness who could later be used as vectors of information), see line 337

4 Results Please simplify and re-order the answers. Help the reader with graphs, pie charts etc. Outline the answers of the religious leaders and key figures of the JUO community, for they could become vectors of preparedness information.

Family names of safety officers are cited, is it common and accepted by the so-called persons, and is it allowed by the NHESS journal?

5 Discussion and Conclusions The discussion needs to be reworked, also focusing on religious minorities. The SWOT analyse is a very good idea that could be more

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



developed to offer preparedness perspectives based on the strong social capital of the JUO. A good perspective would be to submit preparedness ideas to interviewed religious leaders: then emphasis could be put on advices in hardware stores, simple and cheap home security (furniture organisation and securing, basic rescue kits for the family), practical skills based on the specific neighbourhood solidarity in the JUO, the organisation of participatory experiences by the religious authorities for instance.

Figure 1 : in an inset, show map of Israel + Jerusalem location + any specific JUO sector
Table 1 : precise 'epicentral' or 'maximal' or 'downtown' or 'whatever' intensity

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2019-387>, 2020.

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)

