Review

Temporal variations in the wind and wave climate at a location in the eastern Arabian Sea based on ERA-Interim reanalysis data

P. R. Shanas and V. Sanil Kumar
Ocean Engineering, CSIR-National Institute of Oceanography (Council of Scientific and Industrial Research), Dona Paula, Goa 403 004, India

This paper presents statistical analysis, based on ERA-Interim re-analysis, at an Eastern Arabian Sea location aimed at quantifying monthly, inter-annual and decadal variability of the wind and wave climate. The proposed results are worth publishing as potentially useful in different scientific (physical oceanography and coastal science) and technical (engineering design and shipping industry) contexts, but some unconvincing aspects of the proposed analysis must be clarified and the text must be improved.

TO BE CLARIFIED

Section 2.3 Comparison of reanalysis data with measured data

Page 7244 Line 2 “The comparison between the reanalysis and measured SWH data shows very high correlation (correlation coefficient = 0.96) with small RMS error (0.27 m) during both years.”

0.96 is very high! I have found similar correlations only when dealing with astronomical tides (i.e. a quasi periodic process). What about coherence and phase? I think the authors should show the original series and explain such a result.

Page 7244 Line 4 “Scattering Index (SI) value is 0.23 with a positive bias of 0.2m during 2011 whereas slightly reduced SI and bias is observed during 2012 (Fig. 2).”

The scatter of data (in particular for what concerns 2012) seems to suggest significant discrepancies between the two series.

Section 3.1 Variation in wind speed during 1979–2012

The analysis of maxima should be performed in terms of Extreme Value statistics. In particular, it should be considered that the reliability of statistical inference crucially depends upon the shape of the tail of the distribution (the ξ value of GEV distribution) and this has strong influence on the detection of trends.

As a consequence, I am not confident the proposed (in Section 3.5 Statistical trend analysis for the time series data) estimates of trends are reliable for what concerns extremes. More explicitly: if the extreme distribution is “long tailed” (strongly negative ξ) very long time series are needed in order to assess with acceptable reliability the presence of trends.

Section 3.4 Influence of ENSO and Indian Ocean dipole on wind and waves

To be quite frank I think that the analysis of just three events is not sufficient to support all the proposed discussion concerning various modes of climatic variability. I think the authors should limit themselves to explaining different influences of local and distant wind stresses in determining local wave height in view of the proposed scientific and technical potential applications, leaving aside climate problems that are outside the scope of the present work.

SOME DETAILS (suggestions)

Page 7240

Line 5 ….. comparison with the reanalysis …..

Lines 13-15 …..relationships between annual ……….. are tested and it is found that ………. negative IOD years…..
Line 21 ...... are performed for the tropical ........
Line 25 ..........and shows that ERA-Interim ........

Page 7243
Line 10 Either ........ wind speed shows a decreasing .......... or ........ wind speeds show a decreasing ........
Lines 9-10 page 7244 .......... Statistical analysis of wind speed frequency is performed by classifying wind speed into different ranges through ..........
Lines 12-13 The weakening of strong winds is also consistent with the decreasing trend of monthly mean wind speed over 34 yr.
Line 19 ........ study also supports the hypothesis that the cyclonic activity in the AS is decreasing.
Line 25 These are statistically significant decadal variabilities ...

Page 7248
Line 3 ........ observed speeds are ........
Lines 3-5 The most logical cause of the peak identified in the wave height is the increase in wind speeds over time.

Page 7250
Line 24 .......... confident of non-stationarity.

Page 7251
Line 7 Theil Sen’s slope estimate is also a method ........
Lines 13-15 The study shows that during 1979–2012 the annual mean wind speed is characterised by a decreasing trend (1.5 cms−1 yr−1), whereas the annual maximum wind speed displays an upward trend of 3.6 cms−1 yr−1.
Line 24 .......... activity and wind speed finding that the peak event

January 28, 2014

Antonio Speranza